

## Petitioner cannot be penalised for the inability of the Settlement Commission -Bombay HC

16 August 2022



## Summary

In the present case, the petitioner had approached the Bombay High Court (HC) in respect to the order passed by the Settlement Commission abating the application, since it could not be disposed before the cut-off date. In this respect, the HC stated that the petitioner should be permitted to file a fresh application before the Settlement Commission. Further, the provisions cannot be construed as punishing the petitioner due to failure of the Settlement Commission to dispose the application in prescribed<sup>1</sup> time limit, for matters completely beyond his control, where such delay is not attributable to the petitioner. The HC requested the Settlement Commission to dispose the application in the first hearing itself since it had already been admitted.

### Facts of the case

- The petitioner<sup>2</sup> had approached the HC for the order passed by the Settlement Commission. The Settlement Commission concluded the application<sup>3</sup> filed by petitioner as abated since it did not get disposed before the cut-off date. The settlement commission gave liberty to the petitioner to file fresh application.
- The petitioner contended that it had diligently pursued its application, however, the department created an impediment in the progress of the proceedings before the Settlement Commission by challenging the interim order passed.
- The petitioner submitted that the department caused inordinate delay as it created a situation of simultaneously pursuing the case before multiple forums. This caused an obstruction for petitioner's application to be considered by the Settlement Commission.

### Bombay HC observations and ruling<sup>4</sup>

- **Petitioner cannot be punished due to inability of the Settlement Commission:** The petitioner should be permitted to file a fresh application before the Settlement Commission, which will consider the case on the merits in accordance with the law. Further, the provisions cannot be construed as punishing the petitioner for the inability of the Settlement Commission to dispose the application within the specified time.
- **Disposal of application:** The time lost from the date of the impugned order till the filing of application shall be excluded. Further, since the application had already been admitted earlier, hence the HC requested the Settlement Commission to try to dispose the applicant in the first hearing itself.

---

<sup>1</sup> Section 127(c)(6) of Custom Act 2015.

<sup>2</sup> Gurjeet Singh

<sup>3</sup> Section 127b of Custom Act 2015.

<sup>4</sup> Writ Petition No. 563 Of 2009, dated 14 July 2022

## Our comments

Earlier, the Bombay HC in case of Star television News Limited had also held that the petitioner cannot be punished for the inability of the Settlement Commission to dispose the application in prescribed time limit, where such delay is not attributable to the petitioner. This decision was upheld by the Hon'ble Apex Court.

This is a welcoming ruling, protecting the right of the taxpayers and will set precedence in similar matters.

# Contact us

To know more, please visit [www.grantthornton.in](http://www.grantthornton.in) or contact any of our offices as mentioned below:

---

## NEW DELHI

National Office,  
Outer Circle,  
L 41, Connaught Circus,  
New Delhi - 110001  
T +91 11 4278 7070

## NEW DELHI

6th Floor, Worldmark 2,  
Aerocity,  
New Delhi - 110037  
T +91 11 4952 7400

## AHMEDABAD

Unit No - 603 B, 6th Floor,  
Brigade International  
Financial Center,  
GIFT City Gandhinagar,  
Ahmedabad - 382355  
T +91 79 6900 2600

## BENGALURU

5th Floor, 65/2, Block A,  
Bagmane Tridib,  
Bagmane Tech Park,  
CV Raman Nagar,  
Bengaluru - 560093  
T +91 804 243 0700

---

## CHANDIGARH

B-406A, 4th Floor,  
L&T Elante Office Building,  
Industrial Area Phase I,  
Chandigarh - 160002  
T +91 172 433 8000

## CHENNAI

9th floor, A wing, Prestige  
Polygon, 471 Anna Salai,  
Mylapore Division, Teynampet,  
Chennai - 600035  
T +91 44 4294 0000

## DEHRADUN

Suite No 2211, 2nd Floor,  
Building 2000, Michigan Avenue,  
Doon Express Business Park,  
Subhash Nagar,  
Dehradun - 248002  
T +91 135 264 6500

## GURGAON

21st Floor, DLF Square,  
Jacaranda Marg,  
DLF Phase II,  
Gurgaon - 122002  
T +91 124 462 8000

---

## HYDERABAD

Unit No - 1, 10th Floor,  
My Home Twitza, APIIC,  
Hyderabad Knowledge City,  
Hyderabad - 500081  
T +91 40 6630 8200

## KOCHI

6th Floor, Modayil Centre Point,  
Warriam Road Junction,  
MG Road  
Kochi - 682016  
T +91 484 406 4541

## KOLKATA

10C Hungerford Street,  
5th Floor,  
Kolkata - 700017  
T +91 33 4050 8000

## MUMBAI

11th Floor, Tower II,  
One International Center,  
SB Marg Prabhadevi (W),  
Mumbai - 400013  
T +91 22 6626 2600

---

## MUMBAI

Kaledonia, 1st Floor,  
C Wing,  
(Opposite J&J Office),  
Sahar Road, Andheri East,  
Mumbai - 400069

## NOIDA

Plot No 19A, 2nd Floor,  
Sector - 16A,  
Noida - 201301  
T +91 120 485 5900

## PUNE

3rd Floor, Unit No 310-312,  
West Wing, Nyati Unitree,  
Nagar Road, Yerwada  
Pune - 411006  
T +91 20 6744 8800

---

For more information or for any queries, write to us at [GTBharat@in.gt.com](mailto:GTBharat@in.gt.com)



Follow us @GrantThorntonIN

© 2022 Grant Thornton Bharat LLP. All rights reserved.

“Grant Thornton Bharat” means Grant Thornton Advisory Private Limited, the sole member firm of Grant Thornton International Limited (UK) in India, and those legal entities which are its related parties as defined by the Companies Act, 2013, including Grant Thornton Bharat LLP.

Grant Thornton Bharat LLP, formerly Grant Thornton India LLP, is registered with limited liability with identity number AAA-7677 and has its registered office at L-41 Connaught Circus, New Delhi, 110001. References to Grant Thornton are to Grant Thornton International Ltd. (Grant Thornton International) or its member firms. Grant Thornton International and the member firms are not a worldwide partnership. Services are delivered independently by the member firms.