

Sludge manufactured unintentionally cannot be treated as an 'exempted goods' – CESTAT

6 December 2021



Summary

The Customs, Excise, Service Tax Appellate Tribunal (CESTAT) Chennai observed that the sludge emerging from effluent treatment plant is a waste and cannot be considered as a manufactured product. The appellant needs to comply with the pollution control requirements and therefore maintain the effluent treatment plant and remove the waste as per the effluent norms. The CESTAT observed that no manufacturer would consciously manufacture waste rather they would be happy in case where less waste or no waste is generated to reduce the burden of maintaining the effluent treatment plant and transportation of the sludge. Therefore, the CESTAT held that it cannot be said that the waste/sludge is an 'exempted goods' manufactured by the appellant. Further, the CESTAT set aside the demand of 10%/5% on value of sludge removed as required under Rule 6(3) of the CENVAT Credit Rules, 2004.

Facts of the case

- The appellant¹ is engaged in manufacture of Gelatine, Phosphoryl (A), Phosphoryl (B) in their unit situated at Ooty.
- During the manufacturing activity, waste arising from such manufacture is drained into Effluent Treatment Plant. The solid waste removed from the Effluent Treatment plant is 'sludge' and it is removed daily to their dumping yard wherein it gets naturally dried for a few months. The dried sludge is crushed and packed in small bags and sent to fertiliser manufacturers.
- The department alleged that the appellant is also manufacturing exempted product namely 'sludge'. Therefore, since the appellants have used common inputs for manufacture of dutiable product (gelatine) and exempted product (sludge) and did not maintain separate accounts as required², they are liable to pay an amount equal to 10% / 5% of the total value of the exempted sludge cleared by them for the along with interest and penalty.
- The demand for the period prior to 10 May 2008 was set aside by the Commissioner (Appeals) and the demand, interest and penalty for the subsequent period was upheld. Aggrieved by such order, the appellants filed present appeal before the Tribunal³.

CESTAT Chennai observations and ruling⁴:

- **Waste is not consciously manufactured:** During manufacture, the waste that arises is drained into the Effluent Treatment Plant. The sludge is dried and thereafter sold to fertiliser manufacturers. The appellant needs to comply with the pollution control requirements and therefore maintain the Effluent Treatment Plant and remove the waste as per the effluent norms. Therefore, such waste arises during the manufacturing activity and is not manufactured consciously.
- **Sludge is not an exempted good:** A manufacturer would be happy in a situation where there is less waste as it leads to minimal maintenance of effluent treatment

¹ Sterling Biotech Ltd

² under Rule 6 (3) of CENVAT Credit Rules, 2004

³ EXCISE APPEAL No. 41097 of 2013

⁴ FINAL ORDER No. 42452 / 2021 dated 25 November 2021

plant. No manufacturer would consciously manufacture waste and thus, it cannot be said that sludge is an exempted good manufactured by the appellant.

- **Demand on value of sludge cannot sustain:** Sludge emerging from effluent treatment plant is in the nature of waste and cannot be considered as manufactured product. Therefore, demand of 10%/5% of value of sludge cannot sustain.

Our comments

The Apex Court in the case of Hindustan Zinc Limited had held that when a by-product emerges as a technical necessity, it cannot be said that any inputs have been used for the manufacturer of the by-product. Therefore, the SC had held that there was no need to maintain separate accounts or payment of 8% under Rule 6 of the CENVAT Credit Rules, 2004. Further, similar ruling was pronounced by the Hon'ble Mumbai Tribunal in the case of M/s JSW Steel Ltd. wherein it had observed that credit of that quantity of raw materials shall be allowed which is required for manufacture of the intended quantity of final products, irrespective of the fact that certain by-products emerge as technical necessity. Thus, the Tribunal had held that the demand of reversal of ITC on inputs used in manufacture of by-product or waste under Rule 6(3) of the CENVAT Credit Rules, 2004 is not sustainable.

This is a welcome ruling by the CESTAT and shall provide required relief to the manufacturing sector and will set precedence in similar matters. Further, an analogy can also be drawn under the GST regime since similar provisions exist even under the GST law.

Contact us

To know more, please visit www.grantthornton.in or contact any of our offices as mentioned below:

NEW DELHI

National Office,
Outer Circle, L 41,
Connaught Circus,
New Delhi - 110001
T +91 11 4278 7070

NEW DELHI

6th Floor, Worldmark 2,
Aerocity,
New Delhi - 110037
T +91 11 4952 7400

BENGALURU

5th Floor, 65/2, Block
A, Bagmane Tridib,
Bagmane Tech Park,
CV Raman Nagar,
Bengaluru - 560093
T+91 80 4243 0700

CHANDIGARH

B-406A, 4th Floor,
L&T Elante Office Building,
Industrial Area Phase I,
Chandigarh - 160002
T +91 172 4338 000

CHENNAI

9th Floor, A Wing, Prestige
Polygon, 471 Anna Salai,
Mylapore Division,
Teynampet,
Chennai - 600035
T +91 44 4294 0000

DEHRADUN

Suite No 2211, 2nd Floor,
Building 2000,
Michigan Avenue,
Doon Express Business
Park, Subhash Nagar,
Dehradun - 248002
T +91 135 2646 500

GURGAON

21st Floor,
DLF Square, Jacaranda
Marg,
DLF Phase II,
Gurgaon - 122002
T +91 124 462 8000

HYDERABAD

7th Floor, Block III,
White House,
Kundan Bagh,
Begumpet,
Hyderabad - 500016
T +91 40 6630 8200

KOCHI

6th Floor,
Modayil Centre Point,
Warriam Road Junction,
MG Road
Kochi - 682016
T +91 484 406 4541

KOLKATA

10C Hungerford Street,
5th Floor,
Kolkata - 700017
T +91 33 4050 8000

MUMBAI

11th Floor, Tower II,
One International Center,
SB Marg Prabhadevi (W),
Mumbai - 400013
T +91 22 6626 2600

MUMBAI

Kaledonia, 1st Floor,
C Wing,
(Opposite J&J Office),
Sahar Road,
Andheri East,
Mumbai - 400069
T +91 22 6176 7800

NOIDA

Plot No 19A, 2nd Floor,
Sector - 16A,
Noida - 201301
T +91 120 485 5900

PUNE

3rd Floor,
Unit No 309-312,
West Wing, Nyati Unitree,
Nagar Road, Yerwada
Pune - 411006
T +91 20 6744 8800

For more information or for any queries, write to us at gtbharat@in.gt.com



Follow us @GrantThorntonIN

© 2021 Grant Thornton Bharat LLP. All rights reserved.

“Grant Thornton Bharat” means Grant Thornton Advisory Private Limited, the sole member firm of Grant Thornton International Limited (UK) in India, and those legal entities which are its related parties as defined by the Companies Act, 2013, including Grant Thornton Bharat LLP.

Grant Thornton Bharat LLP, formerly Grant Thornton India LLP, is registered with limited liability with identity number AAA-7677 and has its registered office at L-41 Connaught Circus, New Delhi, 110001. References to Grant Thornton are to Grant Thornton International Ltd. (Grant Thornton International) or its member firms. Grant Thornton International and the member firms are not a worldwide partnership. Services are delivered independently by the member firms.